APrIGF Multi-Stakeholder Steering Group (MSG) Meeting

22 Mar 2017 (Wednesday)
Adobe Connect
04:00 – 05:00 (UTC)

Attendees (29):
MSG Members
Ali Hussain, Pakistan Information Security Association (Private Sector)
Aris Ignacio, Southville International School and Colleges, Philippines (Academia)
Chat Garcia Ramilio, APC, Philippines (Civil Society)
Cheryl Langdon-Orr, At-Large Member, ICANN (Civil Society)
Chester Soong, Internet Society Hong Kong (Civil Society) – Vice Chair
Duangthip Chomprang, GITEC, Bangkok (Civil Society)
Edmon Chung, DotAsia Organisation (Technical)
Gunela Astbrink, ISOC Australia (Civil Society)
Hiro Hotta, JPRS (Technical)
Hong Xue, Beijing Normal University (Academia)
Irene Poetranto, University of Toronto (Academia)
Izumi Okutani, JPNIC (Technical)
Jahangir Hossain, ISOC Dhaka, Bangladesh (Civil Society)
Joyce Chen, ICANN APAC Hub (Technical)
Leonid Todorov, APTLD (Technical)
Maureen Hilyard, At-Large member, ICANN (Civil Society)
Mohit Saraswat, Pepsi-Dubai Refreshments (Private Sector)
Paul Wilson, Asia Pacific Network Information Centre (APNIC) (Technical) – Chair
Penghwa Ang, Nanyang Technological University (Academia)
Satish Babu, Computer Information Society, India (Civil Society)
Sherly Haristya, Nanyang Technological University (Academia)
Shibendu Debbarma, Tripura University (Academia)
Shreedeeep Rayamajhi, Rayznews (Civil Society)
Sylvia Cadena, APNIC (Technical)

Non-MSG Members
Connie Chan, APNIC (Technical)
Klee Aiken, APNIC (Technical)
2018 Local Host Candidates
Andrew Molivurae, TRR of Vanuatu (Government)
Mikhail Anisimov, .RU ccTLD (Technical)

APrIGF Secretariat:
Yannis Li, DotAsia Organisation

Local Host of 2016:
Absent

Apologies for absence sent in advance (2):
Arun Sukumar, Observer Research Foundation, India (Civil Society) – Vice Chair
Rajnesh Singh, ISOC APAC Bureau (Technical)

Agenda:
1. Agenda Review (Chair)
2. 2018 Local Hosts Q&A
   - Mr. Mikhail Anisimov, .RU ccTLD
   - Mr. John Jack, OGCIO, Vanuatu
   - Mr. Andrew Molivurae, TRR, Vanuatu
3. Minutes and Action Items Review (Chair/Secretariat)
4. 2017 preparation
   - Local Host Updates (Arthit)
   - Program Committee Updates (Chester/Cheryl)
   - Fellowship Committee Updates (Aris)
5. AOB

Proceedings:
1. 2018 Local Hosts Q&A
   - Wilson introduced that each local host candidate have 20 minutes in total which they can decide how to allocate their time on presenting the proposal and taking questions.

   a. Candidate 1: .RU ccTLD

   Anisimov highlighted the below of their proposals:

   • **Host** - The Coordination Centre is the registry of .RU. The main focus is not only to operate the ccTLD but also present Russia in International organizations and events.
   • **Experience** - .RU has already hosted 8 Russian IGF with around 700 guests from around the region which proven their experience in organizing such events and relevant relations.
• **City & Transportation** - The proposed venue is Vladivostok which is a city with many inexpensive direct flights from China, South Korea, Japan, Thailand, Vietnam, etc. It is easy to get speakers and guests from all sub-regions to Vladivostok.

• **Venue** – Far Eastern Federal University

• **Outreach** - .RU has the very strong relations with other registries and stakeholders with the Post-Soviet states especially within the Asia part

• **Support** – There is strong support from government where the representative of the President in the Far East Federal District has expressed his commitment to hosting APriGF 2018.

• **Funding** – Received preliminary confirmation from the board of .RU in funding the entire event with the budget forecast in the proposal.

• **Q&A with MSG Members:**
  - Todorov emphasized that the Far Eastern Federal University is built specifically to host international events which is well-equipped and secured on an isolated island with train. There is a tolerance towards the Internet Governance nowadays and no problem with freedom of expression. He expressed support on Vladivostok that it is in the middle of the region.
  - **Accessibility** – Langdon-Orr enquired about the accessibility of the venue. Local host reassured that the university is modern and recently built which is highly accessible for disabled.
  - **Accommodation** -
    - Babu asked if there is hotel at a reasonable cost available. Local host confirmed that there is a list of affordable hotels in the proposal below $100 and halls for students.
    - Hussain asked if the University can allow on campus accommodation (Guest House, etc) for MSG only. Anisimov mentioned that there shall still be students staying after and Todorov however reassured that there are 1500 rooms altogether in the university hotel complex which would be enough for everyone and students live elsewhere in the dormitory instead.
  - **Awareness** – Chomprang asked if the RU IGF community is aware of APriGF and the respective interest. Anisimov stated that they are close with the local media and will leverage their channels to promote. The RU IGF is well-known and well-attended among the Post-Soviet states.
  - **Funding & Financial** – Chomprang asked if the location is expensive and if there is benchmark of other Asian cities. Anisimov confirmed that
  - **Timing and Season** – Chomprang enquired about the temperature of the event period. Secretariat confirmed that the proposed date is during the week of 24 – 29 Jul which temperature ranges from 19 to 26 degree celcius.
  - **VISA** –
RU and the University both can handle the VISA request professionally with a specific department. Todorov suggested that a tourist VISA for applicants would be an easier process for attendees to apply on their own if they wish.

Cadena questioned how difficult it might be for international human rights advocates to get a VISA. Todorov replied that should not be a deep problem since Russia hasn’t had any poor records of denying anyone from entering except for other reasons such as immigration attempts of some Africans to Europe through Russia.

**Freedom of Expression** – Ramilio echoed Cadena’s concern on the safety of the participating human rights advocates especially for the local participants. Todorov replied that no one in Russia really care about whether certain person advocate or breach any human rights issues and no one would receive harsh treatment selectively.

**b. Candidate 2: OGCIO and TRR of Vanuatu**

- Molivurae explained that Jack unfortunately could not attend the meeting and himself representing TRR the supporting organization of the proposal could address any questions the MSG might have.
- Secretariat added that the proposal of Vanuatu is the same as the bid
- Molivurae highlighted that 2018 is a very special year for Vanuatu in terms of Internet penetration rate. The government has loosen policies and 90% of population will be covered in Jan 1 2018. The country bandwidth is very good as well.
- **Venue and Hotels** – The convention center is new and there are hotels around with enough accommodation for everyone. Facilities of the conference are up to par.
- **Expected number of local participants** – Molivurae mentioned there is a high interest especially young people but cannot provide an actual figure.
- **Inclusion of Pacific Community** – Yes
- **Funding Commitment** – Wilson asked if there is any committed funding from other sponsors or commitment from the host to cover the shortfall. Molivurae updated that John Jack and Jackson Mlake is following up with the Prime Minister on a letter of approval to support the event proposal. Cadena asked if there is any local sponsors confirmed and Molivurae confirmed that there is non at the moment. Hilyard added that InternetNZ has previously expressed commitment to support the event financially.
- **Experience** – Saraswat asked if there is any similar event organized in the past and the respective attendance. Molivurae said that the Pacific regional IGF will be held in 2 months time and could be an opportunity to promote APRIGF.
- **Pacific IGF** – Wilson suggested that Molivurae to share the news with the MSG as a reference of interest. Molivurae confirmed that there are progressive meetings
and the upcoming meeting is next week which he will further update the MSG.

- **Accessibility** – Langdon-Orr raised the concern on accessibility on the venue especially if the accommodation is different from the convention center. Molivurae confirmed that most of the accommodation in Vanuatu could cater for disabled people.

- **Earthquake** – Chomprang enquired about the earthquake projection for 2018 and Molivurae reverted that he does not have the information.

- Wilson thanked the participation and proposal submission from both the Russian and Vanuatu team. He urged the representatives to keep an eye on any further questions coming from the MSG while he believe we will keep the window open as there is no urgency in making the decision at the moment.

- Secretariat proposed to open for Q&A on mailing list for another week and set out a poll to finalize before the next MSG meeting. There is no objection on the proposed approach from the MSG.

**Action Items:**
- MSG members to give a final review of the proposals and raise any questions or comments within a week.
- 2018 host candidates to provide any further supplement information if they wish.
- Secretariat to organize the polling for 2018 local host decision

2. **Minutes and Action Items Review (Chair/Secretariat)**

- Adopted the minutes on 8 Mar 2017
- Local host has yet to confirm the definite venue capacity and the accessibility arrangement of the canteen.

**Action Items:**
- Adopted the minutes of 8 Mar 2017
- Secretariat to try reaching out to the local host again to confirm the details.

3. **2017 Preparations**

**Local Host Updates**
- **Venue Selection** – Secretariat reminded that the venue selection has to be finalized by end of March but the local host is unreachable at the moment.
**Program Committee Updates**

- Soong updated that the call for workshop is closed last week with good response of 99 proposals in total. No discussion has been made yet on details of the proposals. The evaluation will be on-going until 10 Apr. The list is public on http://apps.2017.rigf.asia/submission/proposallist.

- **Late Submission** –
  - Soong further added that there are email exchanges on one late submission request but no deliberate decision has been made. However, Soong expressed his opinion and concern on the fairness for those who respected the deadline.
  - Cadena suggested to do a poll among the Program Committee and the MSG agreed that the Program Committee shall have the deliberation to make recommendations on the handling of late submissions.

- **Conflict of Interest** –
  - Cadena asked to clarify about the conflict of interests of Program Committee members with proposals submitted from their affiliated organization.
  - Wilson suggested that Program Committee member should not evaluate proposals from the same affiliated organization of their own as long as consistency is made across the Committee.
  - Chung argued that some organization may be relatively large with different department such as University and therefore the declaration shall precise instead of clear cut decision.
  - Soong echoed Chung’s suggestion.
  - Wilson suggested the Program Committee to document the policy of Conflict of Interest that the Committee decided and enforce it. Other MSG members agreed with the approach.

**Action Items:**

- Secretariat to propose suggested resolution to Program Committee based on the feedback from all members and organize a poll if needed.
- Soong and Langdon-Orr to lead the Program Committee on documenting the policy of the Conflict of Interest clearly and enforce that.

**Fellowship Committee Updates**

- Hilyard updated that 163 applications received in total. The evaluation period ends on 27 Mar and to be reported on 5 Apr MSG meeting.
- The Program Committee reached a consensus that late submission requests will not be entertained.
- The Buddy Program will be continued in 2017 and the discussion on the eligibility and recruitment of the buddies are still on going.
4. AOB

- Chung shared with the MSG a new initiative Asia Pacific Legislative Roundtable (APLR) in conjunction with the APriGF to induce the politicians and policy makers to participate at APriGF. Participation confirmations have been received from Malaysia, Taiwan, Hong Kong, Bangladesh. Other economies that have been reached out and with some initial interests are Nepal, Japan, Thailand, Singapore, Australia and New Zealand. Chung believed it is likely to happen with the interests and will share more information to the MSG.

- Wilson appreciated the sharing from Chung and encourage more information to be provided so that other MSG members can help to invite more participants

Action Items:

- Chung to share more details of APLR on the MSG list.

Summary of Actions Items

- MSG members to give a final review of the proposals and raise any questions or comments within a week.
- 2018 host candidates to provide any further supplement information if they wish.
- Secretariat to organize the polling for 2018 local host decision
- Adopted the minutes of 8 Mar 2017 meeting
- Secretariat to try reaching out to the local host again to confirm the details.
- Secretariat to propose suggested resolution to Program Committee based on the feedback from all members and organize a poll if needed.
- Soong and Langdon-Orr to lead the Program Committee on documenting the policy of the Conflict of Interest clearly and enforce that.
- Chung to share more details of APLR on the MSG list.

The next meeting will be held on 5 Apr (Wed) 2017 at 4:00 - 5:00 (UTC).